
Inborn Errors of Metabolism That Use Dietary Management: Considerations for Optimizing and Standardizing Diet in Clinical Trials for Drug Product Development Guidance for Industry

DRAFT GUIDANCE

This guidance document is being distributed for comment purposes only.

Comments and suggestions regarding this draft document should be submitted within 60 days of publication in the *Federal Register* of the notice announcing the availability of the draft guidance. Submit electronic comments to <https://www.regulations.gov>. Submit written comments to the Dockets Management Staff (HFA-305), Food and Drug Administration, 5630 Fishers Lane, Rm. 1061, Rockville, MD 20852. All comments should be identified with the docket number listed in the notice of availability that publishes in the *Federal Register*.

For questions regarding this draft document, contact (CDER) Division of Rare Diseases and Medical Genetics, Dina Zand at 240-402-2538, or (CBER) Office of Communication, Outreach and Development, 800-835-4709 or 240-402-8010.

**U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
Food and Drug Administration
Center for Drug Evaluation and Research (CDER)
Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research (CBER)**

**July 2023
Clinical/Medical
Revision 1**

Inborn Errors of Metabolism That Use Dietary Management: Considerations for Optimizing and Standardizing Diet in Clinical Trials for Drug Product Development Guidance for Industry

Additional copies are available from:

*Office of Communications, Division of Drug Information
Center for Drug Evaluation and Research
Food and Drug Administration
10001 New Hampshire Ave., Hillandale Bldg., 4th Floor
Silver Spring, MD 20993-0002
Phone: 855-543-3784 or 301-796-3400; Fax: 301-431-6353
Email: druginfo@fda.hhs.gov*

<https://www.fda.gov/drugs/guidance-compliance-regulatory-information/guidances-drugs>

and/or

*Office of Communication, Outreach, and Development
Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research
Food and Drug Administration
10903 New Hampshire Ave., Bldg. 71, Room 3128
Silver Spring, MD 20993-0002
Phone 800-835-4709 or 240-402-8010
Email, ocod@fda.hhs.gov*

<https://www.fda.gov/vaccines-blood-biologics/guidance-compliance-regulatory-information-biologics/biologics-guidances>

**U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
Food and Drug Administration
Center for Drug Evaluation and Research (CDER)
Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research (CBER)**

**July 2023
Clinical/Medical
Revision 1**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
II.	BACKGROUND	2
III.	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	3
	A. Optimizing, Standardizing, and Maintaining Diet Stability in Clinical Trials.....	3
	B. Procedures and Intercurrent Illnesses.....	4
	C. Clinical Trial Design	5
	D. Challenges and Limitations of Diet Assessments.....	6

1 **Inborn Errors of Metabolism That Use Dietary Management:**
2 **Considerations for Optimizing and Standardizing Diet**
3 **in Clinical Trials for Drug Product Development**
4 **Guidance for Industry¹**
5
6

7
8 This draft guidance, when finalized, will represent the current thinking of the Food and Drug
9 Administration (FDA or Agency) on this topic. It does not establish any rights for any person and is not
10 binding on FDA or the public. You can use an alternative approach if it satisfies the requirements of the
11 applicable statutes and regulations. To discuss an alternative approach, contact the FDA staff responsible
12 for this guidance as listed on the title page.
13

14
15
16 **I. INTRODUCTION**
17

18 This guidance describes the Food and Drug Administration’s (FDA’s) current recommendations
19 for optimizing and standardizing dietary management in clinical trials for drug products intended
20 to treat inborn errors of metabolism when dietary management is important for metabolic
21 control.² Optimizing and standardizing dietary management in patients diagnosed with inborn
22 errors of metabolism before they enter clinical trials and during clinical trials reduces an
23 important source of bias and variability, improves interpretability, and may allow for smaller and
24 more efficient clinical trials.
25

26 This guidance does not address scenarios in which dietary optimization and standardization may
27 be infeasible (e.g., diseases with prominent neuropsychiatric symptoms). For those programs,
28 bias from differential dietary management can best be addressed with randomization and
29 blinding. This guidance also does not address general issues of statistical analysis or clinical trial
30 design. Those topics are addressed in the ICH guidances for industry *E9 Statistical Principles*
31 *for Clinical Trials* (September 1998) and *E10 Choice of Control Group and Related Issues in*
32 *Clinical Trials* (May 2001), respectively.³
33

34 This guidance revises the draft guidance of the same name issued on July 24, 2018. This
35 revision clarifies that:

¹ This guidance has been prepared by the Division of Rare Diseases and Medical Genetics in the Center for Drug Evaluation and Research (CDER) in cooperation with the Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research (CBER) at the Food and Drug Administration.

² For this guidance, the term *drug products* includes both human drugs and biological drug products regulated by CDER and CBER unless otherwise specified.

³ We update guidances periodically. For the most recent version of a guidance, check the FDA guidance web page at <https://www.fda.gov/regulatory-information/search-fda-guidance-documents>.

Contains Nonbinding Recommendations

Draft — Not for Implementation

- 36 • Drug products should be studied in conjunction with dietary management for conditions
37 where dietary management is the current standard of clinical care.
38
- 39 • The most informative design is a randomized, double-blind clinical trial that includes a
40 concurrent control group (approved drug or placebo).
41
- 42 • Metabolic control may be evaluated by biochemical analytes and clinical assessment as
43 substantiated by current clinical standards of care.
44
- 45 • Dietary optimization should be based on dietary standards for the relevant population and
46 account for the severity of the patient’s metabolic defect and the patient’s age, growth,
47 and general health status.
48
- 49 • Baseline dietary management standards among patients from different countries should
50 be explained in the protocol.
51

52 In general, FDA’s guidance documents do not establish legally enforceable responsibilities.
53 Instead, guidances describe the Agency’s current thinking on a topic and should be viewed only
54 as recommendations, unless specific regulatory or statutory requirements are cited. The use of
55 the word *should* in Agency guidances means that something is suggested or recommended, but
56 not required.
57

II. BACKGROUND

60 Dietary management is an important treatment modality and standard of care for several inborn
61 errors of metabolism where specific enzymatic defects result in reduced or absent metabolism of
62 a variety of dietary components, with subsequent accumulation of toxic metabolites and organ
63 damage. Dietary management involves restricting particular food components, for example:
64
65

- 66 • Restricting protein for patients diagnosed with urea cycle disorders or organic acidemias
67
- 68 • Limiting food containing certain fats in patients diagnosed with some fatty acid oxidation
69 defects
70
- 71 • Limiting carbohydrates in patients diagnosed with certain primary mitochondrial diseases
72
- 73 • Removing dietary galactose in patients diagnosed with classical galactosemia
74
- 75 • Limiting phenylalanine in patients diagnosed with phenylketonuria
76

77 In some inborn errors of metabolism, dietary management includes supplementation with special
78 formulas that lack specific components (e.g., amino acids or galactose) and the recommendation
79 to ingest vitamins or cofactors that are important and unique to the patient’s metabolic pathway
80 deficiency.
81

Contains Nonbinding Recommendations

Draft — Not for Implementation

82 The goal of dietary modification is to improve or restore biochemical and physiologic
83 homeostasis by restricting the dietary precursors that generate intermediary products of
84 metabolism that may accumulate and lead to toxicity in specific diseases.

85
86 Drug products (e.g., enzyme replacement therapy, enzyme substitution therapy) should be
87 studied in conjunction with dietary management for conditions that use dietary management as
88 part of clinical care. Clinical trials for these drugs typically include measurements of metabolite
89 concentrations (primarily in serum and urine) as endpoints, which are the same assessments used
90 to inform dietary changes and to determine whether dietary management has been optimized.
91 Consequently, dietary changes during these trials can affect efficacy results and pose significant
92 interpretability challenges, particularly when the clinical trial does not anticipate or appropriately
93 account for the confounding effect of diet in the design and analyses of trial results. This
94 confounding can add to the existing challenges in designing and conducting successful clinical
95 trials in rare diseases, such as the limited availability of patients (thus, the small size of clinical
96 trials), the heterogeneity of clinical phenotypes, the challenges with selecting appropriate
97 efficacy endpoints, and the lack of precision of dietary assessments. Inadequate dietary
98 management or insufficient documentation of dietary changes during a trial can make
99 interpretation of trial results particularly difficult when the treatment effect of the new drug
100 product is not large.

III. RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Optimizing, Standardizing, and Maintaining Diet Stability in Clinical Trials

101
102
103
104
105
106
107 Sponsors should consider the following recommendations for optimizing, standardizing, and
108 maintaining the diets of patients before they enter clinical trials:

- 109
110 • When optimizing a patient’s dietary management before trial entry, sponsors should take
111 into account the specific condition that is being treated; the severity of each patient’s
112 metabolic defect; the patient’s age, growth, and general health status; the duration needed
113 to assess whether the patient’s dietary management is appropriate and optimized for the
114 patient’s individual medical needs; and the complexity of, and the patient’s/family’s
115 ability to understand and comply with, the prescribed diet.
- 116
117 • Sponsors should assess and systematically document patient adherence to the dietary plan
118 during the trial. Protocols should include standard measures to verify adherence to the
119 dietary plan (e.g., periodic testing for specific metabolites over time based upon age-
120 related standards, appropriate growth assessments, etc.).
- 121
122 • Sponsors should evaluate the patient’s ability and likelihood of complying with the
123 recommended diet to ensure that patients with a high likelihood of maintaining a stable
124 diet during the trial are enrolled.
- 125
126 • The duration of the run-in period for diet optimization should be justified.
- 127

Contains Nonbinding Recommendations

Draft — Not for Implementation

- 128 • Given the global nature of rare disease trials, sponsors should have an awareness of and
129 clearly state the differences in standards in baseline dietary management among patients
130 from different countries.

131

132 Sponsors should consider the following dietary recommendations for subjects who are
133 participating in the treatment phase of the clinical trial:

134

- 135 • During the trial, patients should maintain a stable diet, and any changes should be
136 documented in a diary and accompanied by the reasons for the changes.
- 137
- 138 • Sponsors should follow the same principles of dietary management across clinical sites
139 according to protocol-defined and allowed dietary modifications. For consistency, the
140 trial protocol should define clearly both the dietary goals and the dietary management,
141 including use of standardized household measurements and scale-measuring devices for
142 estimating volume and weight of food, whenever possible.
- 143
- 144 • Protocols should include precise definitions of diet stability during the trial, including
145 magnitude of allowed deviations generally anticipated in the prescribed diet, such as \pm
146 5% or other change in total daily protein. This definition should be scientifically justified
147 and supported by evidence that a certain dietary deviation will not affect the clinical and
148 laboratory outcomes assessed in the trial.
- 149
- 150 • Patients should enter the treatment phase of the trial during a period of stable metabolic
151 control as evaluated by appropriate biochemical analytes (e.g., ammonia, plasma amino
152 acids, urine organic acids, plasma acylcarnitines, total and free carnitine) and clinical
153 assessments. Sponsors should document baseline dietary information (total daily protein,
154 lipid, carbohydrate, and total daily caloric intake) over an appropriate time period (e.g., 3
155 days) at enrollment.

156

B. Procedures and Intercurrent Illnesses

157

158

159 Patients with inborn errors of metabolism often require increased caloric intake for procedures or
160 assessments requiring sedation that can include dental care, adenoidectomy or gastrostomy tube
161 placement, in addition to intercurrent illnesses that may precipitate a change in metabolic status
162 (e.g., metabolic decompensation with need for dietary and/or pharmacologic changes). Ideally,
163 sponsors should anticipate and address elective surgeries and procedures before enrolling
164 patients in clinical trials. However, protocols also should specify a standardized approach to
165 dietary management for unanticipated intercurrent procedures, illnesses, and metabolic events
166 that may occur during the trial. Adherence to this approach should be documented
167 systematically and addressed in the statistical analysis plan, including how these intercurrent
168 events will impact the efficacy and safety assessments and clinical interpretation of data.

169

Contains Nonbinding Recommendations

Draft — Not for Implementation

C. Clinical Trial Design

Sponsors should consider the following recommendations for clinical trial design when an investigational drug is compared with an approved drug or placebo as add-on to dietary management. General considerations include the following:

- The most informative design is a randomized, double-blind clinical trial that includes a concurrent control group (approved drug or placebo). Dietary management should be consistent across all trial arms such that regardless of treatment arm, all patients should be receiving optimized standard of care, including dietary management.
- Sponsors can consider different types of controlled, randomized clinical trial designs (e.g., crossover, randomized withdrawal, delayed start). An active-controlled noninferiority design is one possible approach if there is an already approved therapy and it is possible to justify a noninferiority margin.⁴ Sponsors should discuss the specific trial designs with FDA for concurrence before initiating the trial.
- Changes in dietary management during a trial can introduce variability, reducing the potential to find benefit for an effective treatment. Dietary changes made to account for growth or disease exacerbation should be prespecified and clearly documented.
- Sponsors should discuss with FDA any performance-based or clinical outcome assessment tools for endpoints intended to establish substantial evidence of effectiveness, including those that may be influenced by dietary changes, before implementing those assessments in a trial(s).

To allow for unbiased comparative efficacy assessments when trials involve dietary management, the use of a concurrent blinded control arm is an essential aspect to the clinical trial design. Comparisons to a nonconcurrent, historical control group have important limitations for the following reasons:

- Standards for dietary management can change over time. An optimized diet for a historical control group may differ from an optimized diet for a concurrent control group or a treatment group in a given trial. This difference can introduce bias in comparisons, as differences in dietary practice can affect the results of the clinical outcomes.
- Differences in the frequency and type of dietary instructions can lead to differences in dietary management and compliance between treatment groups, which can bias efficacy analyses.
- Differences in patient documentation of diet can limit the ability to compare dietary management and compliance between treatment groups.

⁴ See the guidance for industry *Non-Inferiority Clinical Trials to Establish Effectiveness* (November 2016).

Contains Nonbinding Recommendations

Draft — Not for Implementation

- 213
- 214
- 215
- 216
- 217
- 218
- 219
- 220
- 221
- 222
- 223
- 224
- 225
- 226
- Differences in patient baseline characteristics between the historical control group and the treatment group, some of which may be unmeasured, can limit the ability to conduct reliable comparisons.
 - The standards of disease management, including management of concurrent or related conditions, change over time. Changes in disease management compared with a historical control group can also introduce bias.
 - The types and performance characteristics of laboratory assays used to measure metabolic biomarkers/endpoints among the groups can change over time. It is important that sponsors account for these changes when using these assays to evaluate biochemical parameters of metabolic control and to assess dietary compliance or dietary optimization and response to treatment.

D. Challenges and Limitations of Diet Assessments

227

228

229 Although assessments of dietary intake have been used to document dietary practices and to

230 verify the patient's diet adherence, available tools that measure dietary components have

231 limitations. Sponsors should consider the following:

232

- 233
- 234
- 235
- 236
- 237
- 238
- 239
- 240
- 241
- 242
- 243
- 244
- 245
- 246
- 247
- Dietary questionnaires use crude measures of portion size, frequency of consumption, and broad food groupings and are only a general estimate of dietary intake. Thus, day-to-day and week-to-week variation in diets could lead to a range of estimates of long-term dietary intake.⁵
 - Food diaries (e.g., 3-day diet) are commonly used in the clinical management of patients with inborn errors of metabolism. The inherent variability of patient/family recall in a food diary may introduce imprecision into a clinical trial and should be avoided. Using standardized dietary forms (written or electronic) designed or vetted by metabolic dietitians and physicians can greatly facilitate dietary documentation in a clinical trial and is strongly encouraged.
 - Sponsors should encourage families and patients to document their diet frequently during the trial to support the routine documentation obtained during the 3 days before clinical site visits.

⁵ Greenwood DC, MS Gilthorpe, and JE Cade, 2006, The Impact of Imprecisely Measured Covariates on Estimating Gene-Environment Interactions, *BMC Med Res Methodol*, 6:21.